

MINUTES

*“Reducing Climate Change-induced Risks and Vulnerabilities from
Glacial Lake Outburst Floods in the Punakha-Wangdi and Chamkhar Valleys”*

DGM-UNDP/GEF Project Inception Workshop

Date: 17-18 June, 2008

Location: College of Natural Resources, Lobesa, Wangdue Phodrang

Introductory Remarks:

Mr. Dorji Wangda, the Director General of Department of Geology and Mines (DGM) presented the opening address by thanking the donors – UNDP/GEF, World Wildlife Fund (WWF), and the Austrian Coordination Office (ACO).

Dasho Sonam Tshering, Secretary of Ministry of Economic Affairs (MoEA) addressed the workshop by thanking the donors for funding this project. Dasho Secretary stressed his serious concern raised by the receding glaciers in northern Bhutan, both to people living downstream and major planned projects, which are the seed of economic activity, along Puntshangchu chu. Owing to the importance of the EWS to hydropower projects, Dasho recommended to integrate the EWS component of this project with the flood warning component of Department of Energy (DoE) . The Secretary also focused on the importance of community awareness and mentioned that it depends on the communication skills to convince people at risk.

H.E. Nicholas Rosillini, Resident Representative, UNDP Bhutan, presented the threat from glacier retreat and that catastrophes like this will not only affect Bhutan, but across international boundaries in India and Bangladesh. He thanked the co-financers –ACO and WWF and reaffirmed the support to the project on behalf of UNDP.

Dasho Nado Rinchen, the Deputy Minister of National Environment Commission Secretariat (NECS) thanked DGM for the invitation. His Excellency stressed on the impacts and consequences of climate change. Bhutan will not be able to escape climate change although there wasn't any significant contribution from Bhutan to global warming and that climate change cannot be stopped although mitigation measures can be adopted. Fresh water, which are stored in glaciers, are becoming scarce, and agriculture and hydropower, which are the backbone of the economy, are very sensitive to climate change. Dasho Nado Rinchen reminded the participants about the 1994 GLOF and the importance of the two phases of Punatshangchu Project. His Excellency supported the relocating the sensor of EWS to get maximum evacuation time. The importance of community consultation and capacity development of concerned areas such as Gewogs

and Dzongkhags was also mentioned. For community awareness, Dasho suggested that it might be effective to educate the communities about the risks involved rather than to pass government orders.

In delivering the vote of thanks - Mr. Chado Rinchen of DGM thanked Lyonpo Nado Rinchen, Dasho Sonam Tshering, and representatives of donor agencies – UNDP, ACO, and WWF—for their participation and support. He also thanked all the participants for their participation and support.

Mr. Dowchu Dukpa, Project Manager, presented the components of the PDF B phase and various outcome/outputs, stakeholder involvement plan, and Project Board and TSAT Terms of Reference, for the Full Size Project. The annual work plan for 2008 year was also presented.

Ms. Karma Doma Tshering, Project Manager, Disaster Management Division (DMD) made a presentation on the 2008 work plan for the Outcome 3, Output 3.3 & 3.4 of the project which will be implemented by DMD. It may be noted that the activities presented during this workshop has a slight deviation in terms of budget allocation from the activities included in the initial project document.

Mr. Yeshi Dorji, Project Director, presented the technical plan for the proposed mitigation work to lower the water level at Thorthormi Lake. Most of the technical specifications were referred from the technical study conducted by Bhutan-Austria team until 2003.

Towards the end of the workshop, Mr. Doley Tshering from UNDP Bhutan made a presentation on Monitoring & Evaluation of the project and Mr. Karma Rapten from UNDP presented on the “Regional GLOF Risk Reduction in the Himalayas” and its synergy with the third component of the present DGM-UNDP/GEF GLOF project, which will be implemented by DMD.

Key Notes from the discussions:

- **Stakeholders:** The meeting agreed that that Ministry of Health shall be included as a stakeholder of the Project. The Project Manager (DGM) will contact the Health ministry and define its roles and responsibilities with regards to the procurement of equipment and other items required to provide field-based health services in Lunana during the project lifetime.
- **Emergency Evacuation Plan:** Participants emphasized the necessity of an evacuation plan for workers in Lunana in case of eventual emergencies occurring in the course of mitigation works. Participants also stressed the need for insurance of workers in Lunana.
- **Materials Transport:** The meeting demanded detailed research on individual transporting options (air, land) for construction materials into the project area. There should be at least 3 quotes for air-based transport options. Operation

efficiency at high altitude and in a harsh environment were mentioned as factors impacting transport prices..

- **International Cooperation:** It was suggested to intensify communications with similar projects in other countries, particularly Nepal, to enhance the knowledge base for decision-making in the initiation phase. It was also suggested that cooperation options with research institutions which have had a previous role in GLOF risk assessment in Bhutan, particularly the University of Vienna, are explored.
- **Project Board Members:** It was resolved to include Dasho Dzungdags of the respective target Dzongkhags and the Ministry of Health as additional Project Board members. It was agreed that the Project Manager (DGM) will request all organizations listed in the updated Stakeholder Involvement Plan to nominate representatives for the Project Board. The meeting agreed that representatives should be at senior level, able to make decisions on behalf of their organisations. It was agreed that the Project Board would not be involved in day-to-day management tasks of the project, but in critical milestone decisions that require joint ownership and collective responsibility.
- **Technical Support and Advisory Team (TSAT) Members:** The meeting agreed that the Director General of DGM should chair the TSAT. Representatives from concerned Dzongkhags, Department of Energy, and Punatshangchu Hydropower Project Authority (PHPA) should be included as additional members of the TSAT.
- **Project Management Team:** The meeting resolved that due to the stronger role of the DoE in expanding the Flooding Early Warning System, DoE will nominate a focal person responsible for implementing the Early Warning System component of the GLOF project. This focal person would act as a third Project Manager, in addition to the Project Managers from DGM and DMD. DGM will therefore be responsible for overall coordination of the Project Management and technical delivery of Outcome 2, DMD will be responsible for implementation of Outcome 1, and DoE will be responsible for implementation of Outcome 3 of the Strategic Results Framework.
- **Frequency of Project Meetings:** It was agreed that a Project Board (PB) and Technical Support and Advisory (TSAT) meeting will be held at the earliest possible time after the inception workshop. The Project Board will meet at least twice per year. The TSAT will meet at least twice a year. Project managers (DGM, DMD, DOE) will meet at least once per month
- **Early Warning System:** It was decided that the EWS component of the GLOF project needs to be stronger aligned with ongoing flood warning initiatives of the Department of Energy (DoE). This decision was made in view of a more comprehensive early warning system in the Punakha valley. The meeting noted that the DOE, through its existing flood warning programmes as well as the Punatsangchhu I project, will mobilize additional resources to establish a more comprehensive Early Warning System. The meeting agreed that this component of the project will therefore be implemented by Department of Energy, and a focal person from the DoE will take responsibility of the respective Project Outcome. A technical and financial proposal on how the already approved EWS setup can be

extended, as well as Terms of Reference (TOR) of an additional Project Manager from DoE, will be submitted by the DoE for approval by the first Project Board meeting.

- **Food rations for project workers:** The Project Manager (DGM) informed the meeting that although food rations for field workers in Lunana can be provided in the first year of the project (through co-financing by WWF), no funds for rations from the 2nd year onwards have been budgeted for. It was decided that the project management should prepare a cost estimate for food rations and present it to the Project Board. The possibility of re-appropriating budget from different budget lines will need to be evaluated. The meeting decided that government approval to provide such rations as incentives on top of pay and DSA should be sought, as such a provision would superseding existing government rules.
- **Labour Recruitment:** It was suggested to conduct a health screening during labour recruitment in order to avoid unnecessary complications at the work site. It was decided that a Health Certificate, stating that the individual is fit to work in Lunana (>4000 m above sea level), should be awarded to each recruited worker.
- **Project Accountant:** The meeting agreed that if the government is unable to provide a project accountant, the project management Team should hire accountants on contract for the project term.
- **Project Activities and work plan:** The project activities presented by the project manager from DMD and workplan for activities of DGM for 2008-2009 were approved during the inception workshop.

Key decisions:

- The Project Manager (DGM) will evaluate options for Emergency evacuation of workforce from the Lunana project area and ensure that an emergency evacuation plan is in place before mitigation works commence.
- The Project Manager (DGM) will evaluate options for workforce insurance and food rations, based on budget reallocations and sufficiency
- The Project Manager (DGM) will evaluate the costs of airlift-based options for transportation of field equipments and working tools to project the site in Lunana
- The Department of Energy will be responsible to install a comprehensive Early Warning System in the project area and ensure that funds provided by the GLOF project are complemented by resources provided by the DoE to ensure a comprehensive solution.
- On the basis of the existing proposal of an Early Warning System that is already summarized in the project document, the DoE will prepare a technical and financial proposal for a redesign of the EWS, considering additional resources available within the DoE to make the EWS more comprehensive.
- In order to reflect DoE responsibility for the Early Warning System component of the project, DoE will nominate a Project Manager and prepare Terms of Reference for approval by the Project Board. These Terms of Reference will follow the format provided by the Project Document. The Project Board will ensure that all Early Warning-related Outputs listed in the Strategic Results

Framework (SRF) are covered by specific responsibilities of at least one Project Manager.

- Project Board meetings will take place at least twice per year.
- TSAT meetings will take place at least twice per year.
- Project managers (DGM, DMD, DOE) will meet at least once per month
- Health screenings will be conducted for each worker before he/she is recruited to work on mitigation works in the project area.
- Dasho Dzongdags of the Gasa, Punakha and Wangdue Dzongkhags and the Ministry of Health will be included as members of the Project Board
- The Puna Tsang Chhu Hydro Power Authority (PHPA) will be included as member of the TSAT
- The AWP (2008) for both DGM and DMD were presented and approved. Annual The aggregated Annual Workplan for the first year of project implementation will be summarized as an Annex to the Project Inception Report
- The Project Manager (DGM) will invite institutions listed in the updated stakeholder involvement plan of the project to nominate senior members for the Project Board and TSAT. Initial Project Board and TSAT meetings will be scheduled at the earliest possible time, once membership of these bodies has been confirmed by the respective institutions.

Dates and issues for next meeting

- **Project Board Meeting:** July 23, 2008 (Morning)
 - Approval of AWP for 2008
 - Approval of Terms of Reference for Project Managers (DGM, DMD, DoE)
 - Approval of transportation strategy, communication setup and process for labor recruitment,
 - Approval of food, payment/DSA, health and insurance provisions for field workforce
 - Approval of final list of Project Board members & TSAT members
 - Decision on project accountant setup
 - Review of Early Warning System setup in accordance with an updated proposal by the DoE
- **TSAT Meeting:** July 23, 2008 (Afternoon)
 - Discussion of the engineering and safety plan, including recommendations for additional follow-up action by the Project Management Team
 - Definition of ToR for an Engineering and Safety Plan study
 - Approval of a final list of TSAT members and its ToRs

Attachments:

- List of Participants-1
- Meeting Agenda-2

Attachment 1

Inception Workshop: Participants list

| Sl.# | Name | Designation | Agency | Email ID |
|------|------------------------|----------------------------|-------------------|--|
| 1 | Dasho Sonam Tshering | Secretary | MoEA | |
| 2 | Dasho Nado Rinchen | Deputy Minister | NEC | |
| 3 | Mr. Nicholas Rosillini | Resident Representative | UNDP | |
| 4 | Dorji Wangda | DG | DGM | |
| 5 | Gyembo Dorji | Program Officer | DOPH, MoH | gyemdorji2003@hotmail.com |
| 6 | Karma Doma Tshering | Sr. Program Officer | DMD, M | karmdt@mohca.gov.bt |
| 7 | Jambay Zangmo | Program Officer | GNH Commission | jgangmo@pc.gov.bt |
| 8 | Tshering Penjor | Asstt. Program Officer | GNH Commission | tshering@gnhc.gov.bt |
| 9 | Lobzang Tenzin | HRO | Gasa Dzongkhag | lozang_tenzin@hotmail.co.uk |
| 10 | N.K.Giri | Dy. Executive Engineer | DoR, Thimphu | nkngiri@yahoo.com |
| 11 | Kin Gyeltshen | Chief Finance Officer | Dzongkha Adm | |
| 12 | Dago Tshering | Field Coordinator | RSPN | dtshering@rspnbhutan.org |
| 13 | Karma Chhophel | Chief Engineer | DoE, MoEA | kensd@druknet.bt |
| 14 | Sonam Leki | DCFO | AFD,MoEA | lesonam2007@yahoo.com |
| 15 | Sonam Tobgay | | Tarayana | tobay_akautn@yahoo.com |
| 16 | Jigme Choki | Dz. Env.O | Punakha Dzongkhag | jimiechoki@gmail.com |
| 17 | Pema Wangda | BO | Punakha Dzongkhag | pemawada@yahoo.com |
| 18 | Gernot Laganda | Regional technical Advisor | UNDP | gernot.laganda@undp.org |
| 19 | Christian Mazal | Res. Coord. ACO | ACO | thimphup@ada.gv.at |
| 20 | Ramesh Chhetri | Prog. Officer | ACO | thimphu@ada.gv.at |
| 22 | Yeshey Penjor | Sr. Eng. Officer | NEC | ypenjor@nec.gov.bt |
| 23 | Yeshi Dorji | Specialist | DGM | |
| 24 | Karma | Sr. Geologist | DGM | |
| 25 | Dowchu Dukpa | Sr. Geologist | DGM | |
| 26 | Tashi Tshering | Sr. Geologist | DGM | |
| 27 | Chado Rinchen | Sr. Survey Officer | DGM | |
| 28 | Wangchu Bida | Executive Assistant | DGM | |
| 29 | Neten Wangmo | Adm.Assistant | DGM | |
| 30 | Karma Tshering | AEE | PHPA | |
| 31 | Gorab Dorji | AEE | PHPA | |
| 32 | Karma Raptan | PSO | UNDP | karma.raptan@undp.org |
| 33 | Doley Tshering | | UNDP | |

Attachment 2

Agenda for the GLOF project Inception Workshop

Venue: College of Natural Resources

Date: 17-18 June 2008

16 June 2008

All participants arrive and check in into CNR Guest House / YT Hotel

Dinner will be served at YT Guest House from 1900-2000

17 June 2008

- | | | |
|---|-------------|--|
| 1 | 0830 – 0850 | Registration of participants |
| 2 | 0855 | Arrival of Chief Guest |
| 0900 – 1005 <i>Opening ceremony</i> | | |
| 3 | 0900 – 0915 | Marchang ceremony |
| 4 | 0915 – 0925 | Welcome address by Mr. Director General, DGM |
| 5 | 0925 – 0935 | Address by Dasho Sonam Tshering, Secretary, MoEA |
| 6 | 0935 – 0945 | Address by RR, UNDP |
| 7 | 0945 – 0955 | Address by Dasho Nado Rinchen, Deputy Minister National Environment Commission (Chief Guest) |
| 8 | 0955 – 1005 | Vote of thanks by Mr. Chado Rinchen, Head, HQ Support Section, DGM |
| 1005 – 1035 <i>Tea break and photo session</i> | | |
| 9 | 1040 - 1120 | Project Overview by Mr. Dawchu Dukpa, Project Manager, DGM <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Project goals, objectives, budgets○ Project log-frame – goal, objectives, outcomes, outputs○ Project Organogram, stakeholder involvement plan, etc.○ Project board, technical committee○ Detailed project AWP Year 1○ Project issues and update |
| 10 | 1120 - 1150 | Presentation by Mrs. Karma D. Tshering, DMD Project Manager |
| 11 | 1150 – 1300 | Discussion & decision |
| 1300 – 1400 <i>Lunch</i> | | |
| 12 | 1400 – 1430 | Thorthormi Lake mitigation measures by Mr Yeshi Dorji, PD |
| 13 | 1430 – 1500 | Discussion |
| 14 | 1500 – 1520 | Project reporting and other requirements by Doley Tshering <ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Quarterly progress reports, annual reports (PIR)○ Financial reporting (FACE reporting)○ Lessons documentation, project monitoring and evaluation |
| 15 | 1520 – 1530 | Discussion |
| 1530 – 1545 <i>Tea Break</i> | | |
| 16 | 1545 – 1600 | Presentation on the Regional GLOF project and updates (Karma Raptan, UNDP) |
| 17 | 1600 – 1630 | Discussion |
| 1900 – 2100 <i>Closing Dinner and Socials</i> | | |
| 18 June 2008 | | |
| | 0800 – 0845 | Breakfast |
| 18 | 0900 - 1200 | Field trip (picnic lunch at Samdingkha) |
- All participants leave after lunch**
